# **APPENDIX H – FINANCIAL ASSURANCE**

**Post-Closure Care Cost Estimate** 



Bullock, Bennett & Associates, LLC \* 165 N. Lampasas Street \* Bertram, Texas 78605 Telephone: 512.355.9198 \* Fax: 512.355.9197

**DATE** February 20, 2024

**TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM** 

BBA Project No. 23643-01-2024

TO Mr. Eric Chavers Luminant

FROM Dan Bullock, PE/Will Vienne, PG

MARTIN LAKE POWER PLANT PDP-5, ASH PONDS AND A1 AREA LANDFILL POST CLOSURE CARE COST ESTIMATES - REVISION 2

Luminant Generation Company, LLC (Luminant) owns and operates the Martin Lake Steam Electric Station (MLSES) located approximately five miles southwest of Tatum in Rusk County, Texas. Coal Combustion Residuals (CCR) including fly ash, bottom ash, and gypsum are generated as part of MLSES unit operation and managed in Permanent Disposal Pond No. 5 (PDP-5), the Bottom Ash Ponds and New Scrubber Pond (referred to collectively as the Ash Ponds) and in the A1 Area Landfill (A1 LF).

These CCR Units are regulated under 40 CFR 257, Subpart D (the "Federal CCR Rule") and 30 Texas Administrative Code (TAC) Chapter 352 (The "TCEQ CCR Rule"). In accordance with 30 TAC §352.201, Luminant is required to submit an application to TCEQ to obtain a registration for each of these CCR Units. Bullock, Bennett & Associates, LLC (BBA) was retained by Luminant to assist with preparation of Post Closure Care Cost Estimates (PCCEs) for PDP-5, the Ash Ponds and the A1 LF in accordance with §352.1101. This technical memorandum presents the PCCEs estimated by BBA for these units. The PCCEs were prepared using TCEQ Technical Guidance Documents TG-30 and TG-31 and related documents.

#### 1.0 CCR Unit Closure Assumptions

The PCCEs were prepared based on the following closure assumptions for the MLSES CCR Units:

- PDP-5:
  - CCR Unit Closure:
    - Closure in Place with low permeability cap
    - Cap Area: 40 acres
  - Groundwater Closure:
    - No evidence of a release to groundwater to date
    - Continuation of Detection Monitoring for Groundwater
    - Nine (9) monitoring wells sampled semi-annually
  - Existing Leachate Collection System operated throughout post closure care period

## Ash Ponds:

- West Ash Pond (WAP), East Ash Pond (EAP) and New Scrubber Pond (NSP) managed as one CCR Unit
- CCR Unit Closure:
  - Closure in Place with low permeability cap
  - Cap Areas:
    - WAP and EAP Cap Area: 25 acres

NSP Cap Area: <u>13 acres</u>
 Total: <u>38 acres</u>

- Groundwater Closure:
  - Monitored Natural Attenuation (MNA) with MNA Groundwater Monitoring
  - Continuation of Detection and Assessment Monitoring for Groundwater
  - Seven (7) monitoring wells sampled semi-annually

#### A-1 Area Landfill:

- CCR Unit Closure:
  - Closure in Place with low permeability cap
  - Cap Areas:

Existing Cap Area: 464 acres
 Future Cap Area: 321 acres
 Total: 785 acres

- Groundwater Closure:
  - Monitored Natural Attenuation (MNA) with MNA Groundwater Monitoring
  - Continuation of Detection and Assessment Monitoring for Groundwater
  - Twelve (12) monitoring wells sampled semi-annually

#### 2.0 Post Closure Care Cost Assumptions

The following general assumptions were incorporated into the PCCEs:

- Post Closure Care Period. A post-closure care period of 30 years is assumed in accordance with 30 TAC §352.1241 and 40 CFR § 257.104(c).
- <u>CCR Unit Inspections</u>. Weekly and annual inspections of the CCR Units are required under §352.831 and §352.841. It is assumed that these inspections will continue throughout the Post Closure Care Period.
- <u>Final Cover Maintenance</u>. It is likely that some level of maintenance/repair will be required for the final cover systems used to close the CCR Units. The PCCEs include the following assumptions for final cover maintenance/repair:
  - Years 1-5 After Closure it is assumed that erosion damage on 5% of the cap soil will be repaired each year. The thickness of each repair is assumed to average 6 inches of soil. In addition, the repaired areas will be revegetated.
  - Years 6-30 After Closure it is assumed that erosion damage on 5% of the cap soil will be repaired three times during this period. The thickness of each repair is assumed to average 6 inches of soil. In addition, the repaired areas will be revegetated.
  - Estimated engineering/mobilization costs associated with the repairs/revegetation are included in the PCCEs.
  - Annual moving costs for the final cover are included in the PCCEs.
- General Site Maintenance. Maintenance of run-off/drainage structures, access roads, fencing, signs, etc. are included in the PCCEs.
- <u>Groundwater Monitoring</u>. Semi-annual groundwater monitoring in accordance with the Federal/TCEQ CCR Rules (detection monitoring or assessment monitoring) is on-going for the units. It is assumed that the current groundwater monitoring program will continue throughout the Post Closure Care Period. It is

also likely that maintenance of the monitoring well system at the units will be required during the post closure care period. The PCCEs assume that one monitoring well will be replaced every 10 years at each CCR Unit.

In addition, the Ash Ponds and A1 LF incorporate MNA as a groundwater remedy as part of closure. For those CCR Units, it is assumed that MNA analyses will be included in the semi-annual groundwater monitoring events.

- One Time Post Closure Care Costs. The following one time activities associated with post closure care are included in the PCCEs:
  - Deed Notices/Surveys
  - Monitoring Well Plugging and Abandonment
- Leachate Collection PDP-5. Martin Lake PDP-5 is constructed with a leachate collection system to remove leachate from the unit after closure. For the PDP-5 PCCE, it is assumed that all free liquids in PDP-5 will be removed during closure and the existing leachate collection system will be operated throughout the post closure care period to remove water that infiltrates through the low permeability cap. For the PCEE, the average annual volume of leachate generated following closure was estimated to be approximately 1,000 gallons per year using the Hydrologic Evaluation of Landfill Performance (HELP) Model (see Attachment A). Costs to dispose of this estimated volume of leachate as Class II Industrial Waste and maintain the leachate collection system through the post closure care period are included in the PCCE for PDP-5.
- Contingency. A 10% contingency factor is included in the PCCEs.
- All costs are in 2021 dollars.

#### 3.0 Post Closure Care Cost Estimate

Based on the assumptions listed above, the 30-Year post closure care cost estimates for the MLSES CCR Units are as follows (see Tables 1, 2 and 3 for details):

PDP-5: \$2,026,787
 Ash Ponds: \$2,058,214
 A1 LF: \$8,273,063

It should be noted that the PCCEs presented herein are considered Opinions of Probable Cost and represent BBA's best judgement based on the assumptions stated, information available at the time the estimates were prepared, and BBA's experience with similar sites. The PCCEs are susceptible to variations in future cost of materials, labor, and equipment and should not be considered guaranteed maximum prices for post closure care activities.

Please do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions or comments.

Dan B. Bullock, P.E.

Principal Engineer (TX PE 82596) Bullock, Bennett & Associates, LLC

1 B. Sullah

DANIEL B. BULLOCK
B. 82596
B. S. ONAL ENGLES

Will Vienne, P.G. Senior Consultant

Bullock, Bennett & Associates, LLC

2/20/2024

# **TABLES**

Table 1

Martin Lake Steam Electric Station - PDP-5

Post Closure Care Cost Estimate - 30 TAC 352.1101

					No. of	
Item	Unit	Rate	Quantity	Cost/Event	Events	30-Year Cost
CCR Unit Inspections (Annually)	LS	\$15,000	1	\$15,000	30	\$450,000
Final Cover Maintenance						
- Erosion Repair, 6-inch avg. thickness, 5% of cap per year, Years 1-5	CY	\$5	1,613	\$8,067	5	\$40,333
- Erosion Repair, 6-inch avg. thickness, 5% of cap, 3 times, Years 6-30	CY	\$5	1,613	\$8,067	3	\$24,200
- Revegetation, 5% of cap area per year, Years 1-5	AC	\$1,500	2.0	\$3,000	5	\$15,000
- Revegetation, 5% of cap area, 3 times, Years 6-30	AC	\$1,500	2.0	\$3,000	3	\$9,000
- Engineering/Mobilization for Final Cover Repairs/Revegetation Events	LS	\$5,000	1	\$5,000	8	\$40,000
- Mowing, per year	AC	\$150	40	\$6,000	30	\$180,000
General Site Maintenance (Annually)						
- Run-off/Drainage Structures	LS	\$2,000	1	\$2,000	30	\$60,000
- Access Roads, fencing, signs, etc.	LS	\$1,000	1	\$1,000	30	\$30,000
Leachate Management (Annually)						
- Leachate Disposal (Class II)	Gal	\$10	1,000	\$10,000	30	\$300,000
- Leachate System Maintenance	LS	\$2,000	1	\$2,000	30	\$60,000
GW Monitoring (Annually)						
- Detection Monitoring - Semi-annual Collection/Analysis, (9 MWs, 1 Dup)	EA	\$500	10	\$5,000	60	\$300,000
- Annual Report	LS	\$10,000	1	\$10,000	30	\$300,000
- Monitoring Well Maintenance (1 MW replaced every 10 years)	EA	\$5,000	1	\$5,000	3	\$15,000
One Time Post Closure Care Costs						
- Deed Notices/Surveys	LS	\$10,000	1	\$10,000	1	\$10,000
- Monitoring Well Plugging and Abandonment	EA	\$1,000	9	\$9,000	1	\$9,000
Subtotal 30-Year Post Closure Care Costs:						\$1,842,533
Contingency (10%):					\$184,253	
		30	-Year Post	Closure Cost E	stimate:	\$2,026,787

#### Notes:

- 1. All Costs in 2021 Dollars
- 2. SY square yard
- 3. CY cubic yard
- 4. EA each
- 5. AC acre
- 6. M month
- 7. Gal gallons
- 8. See Technical Memorandum for cost assumptions

Table 2

Martin Lake Steam Electric Station - Ash Ponds
Post Closure Care Cost Estimate - 30 TAC 352.1101

					No. of	
Item	Unit	Rate	Quantity	Cost/Event	Events	30-Year Cost
CCR Unit Inspections (Annually)	LS	\$15,000	1	\$15,000	30	\$450,000
Final Cover Maintenance						
- Erosion Repair, 6-inch avg. thickness, 5% of cap per year, Years 1-5	CY	\$5	1,533	\$7,663	5	\$38,315
- Erosion Repair, 6-inch avg. thickness, 5% of cap, 3 times, Years 6-30	CY	\$5	1,533	\$7,663	3	\$22,989
- Revegetation, 5% of cap area per year, Years 1-5	AC	\$1,500	1.9	\$2,850	5	\$14,250
- Revegetation, 5% of cap area, 3 times, Years 6-30	AC	\$1,500	1.9	\$2,850	3	\$8,550
- Engineering/Mobilization for Final Cover Repairs/Revegetation Events	LS	\$5,000	1	\$5,000	8	\$40,000
- Mowing, per year	AC	\$150	38	\$5700	30	\$171,000
General Site Maintenance (Annually)						
- Run-off/Drainage Structures	LS	\$3,000	1	\$3,000	30	\$90,000
- Access Roads, fencing, signs, etc.	LS	\$1,500	1	\$1,500	30	\$45,000
GW Monitoring (Annually)						
- Detection Monitoring - Semi-annual Collection/Analysis, (7 MWs, 1 Dup)	EA	\$500	8	\$4,000	60	\$240,000
- Assessment Monitoring - Semi-annual Analysis, (7 MWs, 1 Dup)	EA	\$350	8	\$2,800	60	\$168,000
- MNA Monitoring - Semi-annual Analysis, (7 MWs, 1 Dup)	EA	\$200	8	\$1,600	60	\$96,000
- Annual Report (Including MNA)	LS	\$15,000	1	\$15,000	30	\$450,000
<ul> <li>Monitoring Well Maintenance (1 MW replaced every 10 years)</li> </ul>	EA	\$5,000	1	\$5,000	3	\$15,000
One Time Post Closure Care Costs						
- Deed Notices/Surveys	LS	\$15,000	1	\$15,000	1	\$15,000
- Monitoring Well Plugging and Abandonment	EA	\$1,000	7	\$7,000	1	\$7,000
Subtotal 30-Year Post Closure Care Costs:						\$1,871,104
Contingency (10%):					\$187,110	
30-Year Post Closure Cost Estimate:					\$2,058,214	

#### Notes:

- 1. LF linear foot
- 2. SY square yard
- 3. CY cubic yard
- 4. EA each
- 5. AC acre
- 6. M month
- 7. Gal gallons
- 8. See Technical Memorandum for cost assumptions
- 9. All Costs in 2021 Dollars

Table 3

Martin Lake Steam Electric Station - A1 Area Landfill
Post Closure Care Cost Estimate - 30 TAC 352.1101

					No. of	
Item	Unit	Rate	Quantity	Cost/Event	Events	30-Year Cost
CCR Unit Inspections (Annually)	LS	\$15,000	1	\$15,000	30	\$450,000
Final Cover Maintenance						
- Erosion Repair, 6-inch avg. thickness, 5% of cap per year, Years 1-5	CY	\$5	31,662	\$158,308	5	\$791,542
- Erosion Repair, 6-inch avg. thickness, 5% of cap, 3 times, Years 6-30	CY	\$5	31,662	\$158,308	3	\$474,925
- Revegetation, 5% of cap area per year, Years 1-5	AC	\$1,500	39.3	\$58,875	5	\$294,375
- Revegetation, 5% of cap area, 3 times, Years 6-30	AC	\$1,500	39.3	\$58,875	3	\$176,625
- Engineering/Mobilization for Final Cover Repairs/Revegetation Events	LS	\$15,000	1	\$15,000	8	\$120,000
- Mowing, per year	AC	\$150	785	\$117,750	30	\$3,532,500
General Site Maintenance (Annually)						
- Run-off/Drainage Structures	LS	\$8,000	1	\$8,000	30	\$240,000
- Access Roads, fencing, signs, etc.	LS	\$4,000	1	\$4,000	30	\$120,000
GW Monitoring (Annually)						
- Detection Monitoring - Semi-annual Collection/Analysis, (12 MWs, 1 Dup)	EA	\$500	13	\$6,500	60	\$390,000
- Assessment Monitoring - Semi-annual Analysis, (12 MWs, 1 Dup)	EA	\$350	13	\$4,550	60	\$273,000
- MNA Monitoring - Semi-annual Analysis, (12 MWs, 1 Dup)	EA	\$200	13	\$2,600	60	\$156,000
- Annual Report (Including MNA)	LS	\$15,000	1	\$15,000	30	\$450,000
- Monitoring Well Maintenance (1 MW replaced every 10 years)	EA	\$5,000	1	\$5,000	3	\$15,000
One Time Post Closure Care Costs						
- Deed Notices/Surveys	LS	\$25,000	1	\$25,000	1	\$25,000
- Monitoring Well Plugging and Abandonment	EA	\$1,000	12	\$12,000	1	\$12,000
Subtotal 30-Year Post Closure Care Costs:						\$7,520,967
Contingency (10%):					\$752,097	
30-Year Post Closure Cost Estimate:					\$8,273,063	

#### Notes:

- 1. LF linear foot
- 2. SY square yard
- 3. CY cubic yard
- 4. EA each
- 5. AC acre
- 6. M month
- 7. Gal gallons
- 8. See Technical Memorandum for cost assumptions
- 9. All Costs in 2021 Dollars

# ATTACHMENT A PDP-5 HELP MODEL RESULTS

# \_\_\_\_\_

# HYDROLOGIC EVALUATION OF LANDFILL PERFORMANCE HELP MODEL VERSION 4.0 BETA (2018)

#### DEVELOPED BY USEPA NATIONAL RISK MANAGEMENT RESEARCH LABORATORY

.....

Title: Martin Lake PDP 5 Simulated On: 1/3/2022 14:52

#### Layer 1

Type 1 - Vertical Percolation Layer (Cover Soil)

SiL - Silty Loam(Moderate)

Material Texture Number 23

Thickness	=	18 inches
Porosity	=	0.461 vol/vol
Field Capacity	=	0.36 vol/vol
Wilting Point	=	0.203 vol/vol
Initial Soil Water Content	=	0.2798 vol/vol
Effective Sat. Hyd. Conductivity	=	9.00E-06 cm/sec

# Layer 2

Type 4 - Flexible Membrane Liner

LDPE Membrane

Material Texture Number 36

Thickness	=	0.04 inches
Effective Sat. Hyd. Conductivity	=	4.00E-13 cm/sec
FML Pinhole Density	=	1 Holes/Acre
FML Installation Defects	=	4 Holes/Acre
FML Placement Quality	=	2 Excellent

## Layer 3

Type 1 - Vertical Percolation Layer

Clay

Material Texture Number 43

Thickness	=	24 inches
Porosity	=	0.451 vol/vol
Field Capacity	=	0.419 vol/vol
Wilting Point	=	0.332 vol/vol
Initial Soil Water Content	=	0.4174 vol/vol
Effective Sat. Hyd. Conductivity	=	1.00E-07 cm/sec

#### Layer 4

Type 1 - Vertical Percolation Layer (Waste)
High-Density Electric Plant Coal Fly Ash
Material Texture Number 30

Thickness	=	720 inches
Porosity	=	0.541 vol/vol
Field Capacity	=	0.187 vol/vol
Wilting Point	=	0.047 vol/vol
Initial Soil Water Content	=	0.187 vol/vol
Effective Sat. Hyd. Conductivity	=	5.00E-05 cm/sec

# Layer 5

Type 3 - Barrier Soil Liner C (Moderate)

Material Texture Number 29

Thickness	=	48 inches
Porosity	=	0.451 vol/vol
Field Capacity	=	0.419 vol/vol
Wilting Point	=	0.332 vol/vol
Initial Soil Water Content	=	0.451 vol/vol
Effective Sat. Hyd. Conductivity	=	6.80E-07 cm/sec

------

Note: Initial moisture content of the layers and snow water were

computed as nearly steady-state values by HELP.

# **General Design and Evaporative Zone Data**

SCS Runoff Curve Number	=	84.2
Fraction of Area Allowing Runoff	=	100 %
Area projected on a horizontal plane	=	40 acres
Evaporative Zone Depth	=	18 inches
Initial Water in Evaporative Zone	=	5.037 inches
Upper Limit of Evaporative Storage	=	8.298 inches
Lower Limit of Evaporative Storage	=	3.654 inches
Initial Snow Water	=	0 inches
Initial Water in Layer Materials	=	171.343 inches
Total Initial Water	=	171.343 inches
Total Subsurface Inflow	=	0 inches/year

\_\_\_\_\_

Note: SCS Runoff Curve Number was calculated by HELP.

# **Evapotranspiration and Weather Data**

Station Latitude	=	32.31 Degrees
Maximum Leaf Area Index	=	5
Start of Growing Season (Julian Date)	=	0 days
End of Growing Season (Julian Date)	=	367 days
Average Wind Speed	=	6 mph

Average 1st Quarter Relative Humidity	=	1 %
Average 2nd Quarter Relative Humidity	=	22 %
Average 3rd Quarter Relative Humidity	=	88 %
Average 4th Quarter Relative Humidity	=	22 %

-----

Note: Evapotranspiration data was obtained for Dirgin, Texas

# **Normal Mean Monthly Precipitation (inches)**

<u>Jan/Jul</u>	Feb/Aug	Mar/Sep	Apr/Oct	May/Nov	<u>Jun/Dec</u>
3.940712	3.384053	4.449471	3.632658	4.152557	5.603921
3.172363	2.83961	2.855806	4.403743	4.552789	4.108209

\_\_\_\_\_

Note: Precipitation was simulated based on HELP V4 weather simulation for:

Lat/Long: 32.31/-94.55

# **Normal Mean Monthly Temperature (Degrees Fahrenheit)**

<u>Jan/Jul</u>	Feb/Aug	Mar/Sep	Apr/Oct	May/Nov	Jun/Dec
51.6	52.5	64.1	73	79.7	89.4
92.3	89.7	84.1	74	66.1	57.1

Note: Temperature was simulated based on HELP V4 weather simulation for:

Lat/Long: 32.31/-94.55

Solar radiation was simulated based on HELP V4 weather simulation for:

Lat/Long: 32.31/-94.55

# **Average Annual Totals Summary**

Title: Martin Lake PDP 5
Simulated on: 1/6/2022 8:32

	Average Annual Totals for Years 1 - 30*				
	(inches)	[std dev]	(cubic feet)	(gallons)	(percent)
Precipitation	47.10	[5.76]	6,838,323.4	51,154,215.3	100.00
Runoff	4.062	[2.566]	589,755.5	4,411,677.7	8.62
Evapotranspiration	42.959	[5.448]	6,237,618.8	46,660,632.2	91.22
Subprofile1					
Percolation/leakage through Layer 2	0.000690	[0.000293]	100.1	749.1	0.00
Average Head on Top of Layer 2	2.5255	[1.058]			
Subprofile2					
Percolation/leakage through Layer 5	0.000690	[0.000293]	100.1	749.1	0.00
Average Head on Top of Layer 5	0.0000	[0]			
Water storage					•
Change in water storage	0.0747	[1.8339]	10,849.0	81,156.3	0.16

<sup>\*</sup> Note: Average inches are converted to volume based on the user-specified area.

# **Peak Annual Totals Summary**

	Percolation/leakage	Percolation/leaka	
	through Layer 2	ge through Layer	
Year	(cubic feet)	2 (gallons)	
1	94.36	705.86	
2	90.86	679.71	
3	114.98	860.12	
4	133.94	1001.98	
5	68.53	512.66	
6	72.73	544.05	
7	65.14	487.29	
8	129.67	969.97	
9	145.04	1084.99	
10	96.08	718.70	
11	113.33	847.75	
12	127.05	950.38	
13	170.85	1278.05	
14	110.62	827.46	
15	176.37	1319.34	
16	32.26	241.34	
17	135.53	1013.81	
18	114.29	854.96	
19	124.03	927.84	
20	9.75	72.90	
21	36.21	270.86	
22	65.90	492.99	
23	79.54	594.98	
24	31.83	238.14	
25	99.15	741.70	
26	78.99	590.87	
27	111.77	836.07	
28	180.88	1353.09	
29	76.11	569.33	
30	118.42	885.85	